

EXHIBIT P

**SAN FRANCISCO ARTS COMMISSION
CIVIC DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Monday, February 25, 2008

3:00 p.m.

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 70

Minutes

Commissioners Present: John Kriken, Leonard Hunter, Jeannene Przyblyski, Topher Delaney

Staff Present: Luis Cancel, Nancy Gonchar, Vicky Knoop

Call To Order: 3:05 p.m.

Commissioner Przyblyski introduced Topher Delaney, the new Landscape Architecture Commissioner.

1. Bernal Heights Branch Library—Phase 2

Andy Maloney, DPW BOA Project Architect, presented a materials board and updated elevation drawings. He introduced Lizzie Hirsch, Landscape Architect, DPW BOA.

Ms. Hirsch explained that the minimal landscaping will use a Mediterranean plant palette, and it will be primarily along the front of the building. There will be several locust trees to break up large expanses of vertical blank walls. She noted that staff from the Department of Recreation and Parks has reviewed the plant list and determined it to be maintainable.

Commissioner Przyblyski opened the floor to public comment. Commissioner Przyblyski closed the floor to public comment.

Commissioner Kriken inquired about the existing trees in the landscape design.

Mindy Linetzky, Branch Library Improvement Program ("BLIP"), said that the neighborhood successfully petitioned for protected historic status for the trees along the front of the library.

Commissioner Kriken suggested that the Library look into maintenance of these trees to ensure their health and viability.

Commissioner Delaney asked why locust trees had been selected instead of palms.

Ms. Hirsch said that the client felt they couldn't afford palms and the locust trees filled the vertical space.

San Francisco Arts Commission
Civic Design Review Committee
February 25, 2008

Page 2 of 5

Motion to approve Phases 2 of the Bernal Heights Branch Library: Commissioner Kriken

Second: Commissioner Hunter

Vote: Unanimously approved.

2. SFMTA Transit Shelter and Kiosk Designs—Phases 3

Gail Stein, SFMTA Project Manager, introduced Bill Hooper, ClearChannel, and Olle Lundberg, Lundberg Design.

Mr. Lundberg thanked the Committee and introduced Ryan Hughes, Project Manager, Lundberg Design, to explain the technical issues that have changed since the Phase 2 approval.

Mr. Hughes explained that while the original design had no base plate, the shallow depth of the sidewalk has made a base plate necessary. He showed the Committee a sample of the new base plate, which will be no larger than the footprint of the cruciform column.

Mr. Lundberg addressed issues with the construction material of the roof. He explained that while one polycarbonate company has backed out of the project, polycarbonate is still the preferred material, and they are currently seeking out new companies. The other material options are glass or acrylic. While either could be used, acrylic may have longevity and maintenance problems, and glass would require more joints than the current design.

Mr. Hughes explained that the information panel has changed because they will be reusing existing NextBus signs and the signs are only one-sided. On the exterior of the shelter will be the name of the stop. He added that the Muni map has been moved up for better visibility.

Mr. Hughes noted that the top and bottom of the cruciform columns now have four bolts and the columns in the back of the shelter will be deeper.

Mr. Lundberg explained that due to the expected maintenance cost of the bronze-coated shelters on Market Street, the designers are currently looking into sourcing solid bronze for these shelters.

Commissioner Przyblyski opened the floor to public comment. Commissioner Przyblyski closed the floor to public comment.

Commissioner Hunter suggested looking into a Sculpt Nouveau bronze metal coating. He commented that this might be an alternative that would deter metal theft and have a low

San Francisco Arts Commission
Civic Design Review Committee
February 25, 2008

Page 3 of 5

maintenance cost.

Mr. Cancel commented that the NextBus signs would be more user-friendly facing the outside of the shelter.

Mr. Hooper replied that this position was chosen because it is the direction toward which people look to see if the bus is coming.

Commissioner Przyblyski commented that the information panel should be able to evolve with new NextBus signs as they are available.

Mr. Lundberg commented that the shelters are designed in such a way that the NextBus signs could easily be exchanged with another sign of the same dimensions.

Commissioner Kriken asked if the photovoltaics would still be included in the roofs of the shelters.

Mr. Lundberg said that they would be included in the polycarbonate roof or in a more traditional way with glass.

Commissioner Przyblyski clarified that a Phase 3 project should be 95% complete. She continued that if the polycarbonate and the shape of the roof remain the same, then the Committee can approve Phase 3, but if the material or shape changes, the project must come back for an additional review.

Motion to approve Phase 3 of the SFMTA Transit Shelter and Kiosk Designs with the stipulation that the roof be constructed of polycarbonate and the roof shape remain as submitted on February 25, 2008. The Committee also stipulates that the shelters on Market Street are bronze-coated or solid bronze: Commissioner Przyblyski

Second: Commissioner Kriken

Vote: Unanimously approved.

3. Bay Division Pipeline Reliability Upgrade: Tunnel Shaft Housing- Phase 1

Paul Louie, Project Engineer, PUC, explained that this pipeline connects the two other pipelines that the PUC is currently upgrading. It is a one-mile-long tunnel with two shafts. The buildings house two large valves that go down to the pipeline.

Mr. Louie explained that the buildings are in a light industrial area near a railroad that serves nearby facilities. He explained that both are secure buildings with closed circuit television and motion sensors.

San Francisco Arts Commission
Civic Design Review Committee
February 25, 2008

Page 4 of 5

Commissioner Przyblyski opened the floor to public comment. Commissioner Przyblyski closed the floor to public comment.

Commissioner Przyblyski asked if the high security of the building influenced the design.

Mr. Louie replied that the building is the lifeline to provide water to the City and in this design, form followed function.

Commissioner Przyblyski commented that the structures look more conspicuous because they are so blank. She added that a roofline could gesture to some other industrial buildings.

Commissioner Hunter agreed and suggested looking at a few of the recently reviewed Hetch Hetchy buildings. He added that all of the images of the site have buildings with gabled roofs. Commissioner Hunter asked about the construction of the roof and suggested creating a false roof on top of the building.

Mr. Louie explained that the roof is concrete with a metal frame so that the hatch can be removed for maintenance.

Commissioner Kriken suggested that there be a cornice or small details along the bottom of the structure.

Commissioner Przyblyski suggested that the structures should be unremarkable in a more human way. She reminded the design team that this structure may stand for 100 years.

The Committee requested that the project return for Phases 1 and 2 with some sort of modified roofline and a gesture to the surrounding industrial structures. Commissioner Przyblyski suggested that the architect look at other PUC sheds and adopt a similar vocabulary. Other suggestions were to look at the surface of the building and come up with options.

4. **New Business:** Commissioner Kriken asked if the document, Design Issues of Concern to the Civic Design Committee, had been approved by the City Attorney's Office.

Ms. Gonchar replied that the document was still being reviewed.

Commissioner Kriken gave an overview of the document for Mr. Cancel and Commissioner Delaney.

Commissioner Przyblyski said that this discussion should be continued once the Committee is fully staffed.

San Francisco Arts Commission
Civic Design Review Committee
February 25, 2008

Page 5 of 5

Mr. Cancel informed the Committee that the search for new Commissioners is still ongoing, but the Commission is closer to having new appointees.

5. Adjournment: 4:03 p.m.

revised: 6/16/08 vmk